# Macroecological changes in exploited marine systems

Ransom A. Myers (RAM) Derck Tittensor Boris Worm Dalhousie University

FMAP (Future of Marine Animal Populations)part of the Sloan Census of Life http://www.fmap.caPew Global Sharks Assessmenthttp://www.globalsharks.ca

# What was the most common large animal (>40 Kg) in the world? (perhaps this one was)





### Loss of sharks in the Gulf of Mexico 300 fold decline – no one noticed



Oceanic Whitetip captures per 10,000 hooks

Baum and Myers, 2004 Ecology Letters

Circumstantial evidence of oceanic whitetip sharks being common in the Gulf of Mexico



Fitting a simple model to crazy data can yield reliable, and very powerful conclusions



#### Newspaper reports of sharks in Croatia

With training, "experts" can ignore the most obvious of data:

- 1872 Man's head and leg and dolphin in stomach
- 1872 8 Great White Sharks reported caught
- 1888 Woman's body and lamb in stomach
- 1894 Preserved at Zagreb Nat. Hist. Mus.
- 1926 Woman's shoes, laundry in stomach
- 1946 Pig of 10 kg in stomach
- 1950 Encounter during eating a dead calf
- 1954 Attack on boat
- 1975+ -No sightings.

Newspaper reports of sharks in Croatia











#### Community Changes on St. Pierre Bank

### Change of Life History Traits with Exploitation



Hutchings, J. and Baum, J., 2005. Phil. Trans. of the Royal Society B, 360:315-338

### Loss of Genetic Diversity with Exploitation





PNAS 99:11742-11747.

### Loss of populations with exploitation

- > Extinction is when all populations are lost.
- Resilience is lost when the populations are eliminated that are adapted to the present environment.



FIG. 21.—Recaptures to October, 1934, of cod tagged in the Jeddore Rock to Egg Island area, N.S., in May, 1934.



FIG. 18.—Recaptures in May to October, 1934, 1935, 1936 and 1937, of cod tagged near Halifax in June, 1934.



FIG. 15.—Recaptures during "summers" of 1927, 1928, 1929 and 1930 of cod tagged off Shelburne, N.S., during September and the first day of October, 1926.







### There is much less than 10% of cod left -



Hammerhead sharks

### Sphyrna lewini





Science. Jan. 2003. J.K. Baum, R.A. Myers, D.G. Kehler, B. Worm, S.J. Harley, P.A. Doherty

## Results



### Same results for trawl surveys in Gulf of Mexico



Shepherd and Myers Ecology Letters 2005

### Same results for trawl surveys in Gulf of Mexico





Shepherd and Myers Ecology Letters 2005

#### **Decline of Mediterranean Sharks**



#### **Decline of Hammarhead sharks**



Boero F. & A. Carli 1979 – Boll. Mus. Ist. Biol. Univ. Genoa (47)

#### **Decline of Mediterranean Sharks**

#### By catch associated with a Tuna Trap In Tirrenian Sea



"Tonnarella di Baratti"





Hammerhead shark

#### Smooth-hound



## Proportional reduction in current fishing mortality needed to ensure survival of shark populations





Comparative fish biomass (mT/ha)

#### Loss of Reef Sharks in the Hawaiian Islands

N.W.Hawaiian Islands vs Main Hawaiian Islands



Friedlander A.M. & E.E. DeMartini 2002 - Marine Ecology Progress Series





### Common patterns of decline





Longitude

#### Myers and Worm Nature 2003




Latitude



Latitude













Longitude

















Catch Per Hundred Hooks, Year = 1970



Catch Per Hundred Hooks, Year = 1971





Catch Per Hundred Hooks, Year = 1973



Catch Per Hundred Hooks, Year = 1974





Catch Per Hundred Hooks, Year = 1976





Catch Per Hundred Hooks, Year = 1978







### **Study area**



# Analysis repeated using independent research data



Ward and Myers 2005 Eology

# These estimates are conservative: 2 (fish are smaller)



Yellowfin tuna – equitorial Pacific

Change in body size







Mean mass (kg)

#### Loss of species density per decade

- Displayed is the number of tuna and billfish species that are found on a standard longline with 1000 hooks
- > The time series runs from 1952-1999
- It shows how large hotspots are disappearing over time and how few concentrations of diversity remain today

After data from: Worm B, Sandow M, Oschlies A, Lotze HK, Myers RA (2005) Global patterns of predator diversity in the open oceans. **Science** Aug. 2005.

#### 1950s



Worm B, Sandow M, Oschlies A, Lotze HK, Myers RA (Science Aug. 2005)


Worm B, Sandow M, Oschlies A, Lotze HK, Myers RA (Science Aug. 2005)



Worm B, Sandow M, Oschlies A, Lotze HK, Myers RA (Science Aug. 2005)



Worm B, Sandow M, Oschlies A, Lotze HK, Myers RA (Science Aug. 2005)



Worm B, Sandow M, Oschlies A, Lotze HK, Myers RA (Science Aug. 2005)

#### Loss of sharks in the Gulf of Mexico 300 fold decline – no one noticed





Oceanic Whitetip captures per 10,000 hooks

## What about prey fish?



Illustration taken from the book "Encyclopedia of Canadian Fishes" by Brian W. Coad with Henry Waszczuk and Italo Labignan, 1995,

# Explosion of Pomfrets in the Gulf of Mexico ~1000 fold increase – no one noticed



Pomfret captures per 10,000 hooks

Many thanks to NMFS for data and advice

## The Rise of the Marine Mesopredators





Pelagic Sting Ray Pteroplatytrygon violacea



Photos from Phillip Colla, photography

# Explosion of Pelagic Stingrays in the Gulf of Mexico ~1000 fold increase – no one noticed



1950's 1990's Pelagic stingray captures per 10,000 hooks

Many thanks to NMFS for data and advice

## Cod and shrimp biomass in the North Atlantic: time series



Year

Worm and Myers Ecology 2003



## Step 2: Random-effects meta-analysis



The First Collective Act of Humanity was to save the great whales –

despite massive denial

we can do
the same for the remaining
virgin areas of the oceans
and for the great sharks.





#### Blue marlin (*Makaira nigricans*)



#### Sailfish (*Istiophorus albicans*)

1.5 **Blue Marlin** Sailfish Mean 1.0 number of fish per 100 0.5 hooks 0.0 1960 1980 1990 2000 1970 Year











Not only have large predators declined by at least a fact 10, but mesopredators have often increased by at least a factor of 10.

FMAP (Future of Marine Animal Populations)part of the Sloan Census of Life http://www.fmap.caPew Global Sharks Assessmenthttp://www.globalsharks.ca

### Is shrimp trawling driving sharks and rays extinct?



Gulf of Mexico



#### Shallow species are going extinct Deep species are increasing





(9) Baum et al. (2003): Northwest Atlantic.

Not only have large predators declined by at least a fact 10, but mesopredators have often increased by at least a factor of 10.

FMAP (Future of Marine Animal Populations)part of the Sloan Census of Life http://www.fmap.caPew Global Sharks Assessmenthttp://www.globalsharks.ca

Single species models are not even remotely consistent with the data, e.g. Swordfish from the South Atlantic



White Marlin: Atlantic, single species models do not work Very well.



ICCAT shark assessments in the Atlantic don't even remotely fit reliable data: Similar pattern for US government research surveys.



Figure 10 (above). Fit of the model to the North Atlantic blue shark CPUE data for each of the runs considered.

Atlantic, Latitude = -15 to -10



Bluefine tuna (observed diamonds) and modeled – not a very good fit.



### **RED HERRING 1: RATIO ESTIMATION**



## **RED HERRING 2: SPATIAL ESTIMATION**

#### Scenario A



Abundance estimate, Walters' method ......Spatial estimate, Myers and Worm's method

#### Scenario B



---- True population
O Abundance estimate from CPUE
Abundance estimate, Walters' method
### Scenario C



---- True population
 O Abundance estimate from CPUE
 Abundance estimate, Walters' method

# These estimates are conservative: 1.

Bits of tuna did not count; ~25-30% of tropical tunas were initially not counted because of shark damage.



# These estimates are conservative: 2 (fish are smaller)



Yellowfin tuna – equitorial Pacific

Change in body size





# The estimates are conservative 3: you can only catch one fish on a hook.



### These estimates are conservative 4: The sharks probably declined <u>more</u>.





Oceanic Whitetip captures per 10,000 hooks

Baum and Myers, submitted to Ecology Letters

These estimates are conservative 5: The oceans were not virgin.

- Japan harvested ~1,000,000 tons of tuna and marlin in the 5 years before WWII.
- ➤ In 1950 the US harvested ~170,000 tons.
- The 1950 harvest of albacore by Spain was greater than the total recent harvest in the North Atlantic.
- Species that migrate long distances (e.g. southern bluefin tuna, northern bluefin tuna, and albacore) would have reduced by these harvests.

#### These estimates are conservative 7:

changes in depth increases overall efficiency.



## Declines confirmed by independent data:

- The initial high catch rates were seen in early research surveys by Japan and US.
- Declines seen in harpoon fisheries for swordfish and tuna.
- Most tuna traps in the Mediterranean have largely been abandoned, Italy there is a decline from 100 to 3 tuna traps.
- > Complete loss of species in some areas.

# Loss of Bluefin Tuna Populations in the Atlantic

North Sea Bluefin Tuna



> 1. Large declines occurred when effort was relatively small



3. Present fishing mortality due to longlines is around 0.6

IF catchability is constant

THEN the population dynamics are impossible.

However, catchability decreases with size and size has declined





# A Toy Model

- Recruitment constant
- Longline effort increases linearly over 35 years
- Catchability is proportional to the product of: (a) a cumulative normal and (b) food intake (respiration is proportional to the 2/3's power of mass)
- > Present fishing mortality is around 0.6.





#### North Atlantic albacore cumulated catches of youngs and adults fish

Metric tons

# Conclusion

- Immediate action needed to protect some sharks, leatherbacks, loggerheads, and some tuna (Atlantic northern bluefin)
- Productivity (juvenile survival) has increased with exploitation.
- Rapid declines in CPUE reflect real declines in large fish
- Reduced effort is needed to achieve greater economic yield

### Acknowledgements

- Boris Worm, Peter Ward, Leah Gerber, Julia Baum, Dan Kehler, Francesco Ferretti
- > Pew Charitable Trusts
- Sloan Foundation Census of Marine Life, Future of Marine Animal Populations (FMAP)
   NSERC
- > Pelagic Fisheries Research Program
  > German Research Council
  > Killam Foundation
  > Numerous colleagues who shared data



Fig. 3. Recent reconstruction, using virtual population analysis, of the Newfoundland northern cod decline, compared with estimates and projections published in various years after Canada took over the fishery under extended jurisdiction. VPA estimates based on data in Baird *et al.* (1992) (see also Hutchings and Myers, 1994). NAFO estimates from annual reports for years indicated of North Atlantic Fisheries Organization Scientific Council Reports, Dartmouth, NS. CAFSAC estimates from Canadian Atlantic Fisheries Scientific Advisory Committee Advisory Documents 89/1 and 91/1.

#### Rapid decline in older albacore.



Figure 7 : Evolution of contribution of age classes 6 to 10+ computed by Morita (1977) in longliners albacore catches, 1956-1974.



# Marine ecosystem robustness and the collaps marine fisheries

Ransom A. Myers (RAM) Dalhousie University, Halifax, Canada **One hypothesis:** Fishing mortality Predation on sailfish juveniles Survivorship of sailfish juveniles Sailfish population

# Collapse and Conservation of Shark Populations in the Northwest Atlantic



Science. Jan. 2003. J.K. Baum, R.A. Myers, D.G. Kehler, B. Worm, S.J. Harley, P.A. Doherty

#### U.S. Atlantic pelagic longline sets 1986-2000



Political action is costly for any scientist.

However, it also has great benefits.

To act is to live.

To be suppressed is to die.



Hammerhead sharks

#### Sphyrna lewini





Science. Jan. 2003. J.K. Baum, R.A. Myers, D.G. Kehler, B. Worm, S.J. Harley, P.A. Doherty

# The rest of the slides are back up.



## Thresher sharks

Alopias spp.





Blue sharks

Prionace glauca




### Proportional reduction in current fishing mortality needed to ensure survival of shark populations



### Letter from senate

Put in cod



Boero F. & A. Carli 1979 - Boll. Mus. Ist. Biol. Univ. Genoa (47)

### These estimates are conservative: 1.

Bits of tuna did not count; ~25-30% of tropical tunas were initially not counted because of shark damage.



# These estimates are conservative: 2 (fish are smaller)



Yellowfin tuna – equitorial Pacific

Change in body size





### The estimates are conservative 3: you can only catch one fish on a hook.

These estimates are conservative 5: The oceans were not virgin.

- Japan harvested ~1,000,000 tons of tuna and marlin in the 5 years before WWII.
- ➤ In 1950 the US harvested ~170,000 tons.
- The 1950 harvest of albacore by Spain was greater than the total recent harvest in the North Atlantic.
- Species that migrate long distances (e.g. southern bluefin tuna, northern bluefin tuna, and albacore) would have reduced by these harvests.

These estimates are conservative: 6 Fishermen are smarter (gps, satellite information, **ACDP** (Acoustic Current Doppler Profiler)).



Locations of a leatherback turtle over a two week period tagged by my student Mike James that maintains its position within a cold core ring (somehow).

However, fish may be a lot smarter too (the stupid ones were caught).

**Step 8: You need emotional support. Support from colleagues and family is essential. You cannot do it (for long) by yourself.** 



Why is it so important. What makes them work.

### Shelf seas



Government science was consistently wrong, and there was no effective voice from universities.



### Lessons I Learned from the Cod Disaster:

- Government constrained scientists may consistently ignore what the data tells them.
- Independence is key.
- Multiple, independent analyses are crucial; or else you will be dismissed.
- Speak clearly and honestly to the press, the politicians must know that someone is watching.
- Be proactive, once an animal is ecologically extinct it is too late.

IS May 2003 International weekly journal of science International weekly jou

### **Net losses**

Industrialized fishing hits fish stocks

Financial markets You can't buck the physics

Jupiter's moons Headed for a hundred

Functional genomics The poyer of comparison



### RAM's 12 step plan: From hard core math weenie to passionate conservationist: A PERSONAL ODYSSEY.

Reaching the heart through mathematics.

### **Final point: keep fighting, keep hoping! This happened last week**: Oceanic Whitetip declared critically endangered by ICUN

- Last year is was "species of least concern".
- This change was not because we published one paper in Science, but papers based upon 3 independent datasets (plus 2 math/stats technical papers).
- Skeptics remain more analyses are in prep from scuba surveys of jellyfish
  ( one notices large sharks while diving in the clear open ocean.



### Conclusion: The Factor of 10 Hypothesis

- Scientific investigations of marine fish stocks almost always begin after the fact.
- Here we compile data from which the size of the community of large predatory fishes can be estimated.
- New fisheries tend to deplete the biomass of large predators by at least a factor of 10.
- These declines happen very rapidly, usually in a decade or less.



#### Long - Term Changes In The Gulf Of Alaska Marine Ecosystem



Figure stolen from Paul Anderson

- > The Good -
- Ban directed fisheries on sharks.
- Control fishing on skates.
- > Keep a watch on bycatch.
- The Alaska Board of Fisheries prohibited all directed fisheries for sharks in 1998. In Southeast the bycatch rate for sharks and skates taken during other longline fisheries is 35% of the target species.



by Sarah Gaichas<sup>1</sup>, Michael Ruccio<sup>2</sup>, Duane Stevenson<sup>1</sup>, and Rob Swanson<sup>3</sup>



Figure 1. Big skate, Raja binoculata, with stock assessment author for scale.

Stock Assessment and Fishery Evaluation of Skate species (*Rajidae*) in the Gulf of Alaska

### All large sharks declined



Shallow water species that do not survive discarding: large declines:



Are the pleistocene extinctions\* going to be repeated in the ocean?

\*Present North American biota has lost almost all large species – We have no mammoths, mastodons, giant ground sloths, giant beavers, and 65 other species that weighted more than 100 kilograms.



The extinction of large mammals and flightless birds coincided closely with the arrival of humans in North America, Madagascar, and New Zealand, and less decisively earlier in Australia. In Africa, where humans and animals evolved together for millions of years, the damage was less severe.

## Deeper skate species that survive discarding increased





Stock Assessment and Fishery Evaluation of Skate species (Rajidae) in the Gulf of Alaska

by Sarah Gaichas<sup>1</sup>, Michael Ruccio<sup>2</sup>, Duane Stevenson<sup>1</sup>, and Rob Swanson<sup>3</sup>

Spiny Dogfish, Northwest Atlantic: Good Science – Ugly Decisions



### Danish Landings of Bluefin Tuna Thunnus thynnus



Data source: DIFRES, ICES, FAO



### Landings of Bluefin Tuna Thunnus thynnus in Northern Europe\*



\* = Norwegian Sea, North Sea, Skagerrak, Kattegat, Øresund



### Landings of Bluefin Tuna *Thunnus thynnus* in Northeast Atlantic



DIFRES



Hauser, et al. PNAS, 2002

year






### Life history of sharks...



We Cannot Imagine the Loss of Life in the Ocean: We have to look at data.

Ransom A. Myers (RAM) Dalhousie University, Halifax, Canada

#### **Decline of Mako sharks**



Boero F. & A. Carli 1979 – Boll. Mus. Ist. Biol. Univ. Genoa (47)

#### Thresher sharks

Alopias spp.





Blue sharks

Prionace glauca









Area



#### **Decline of Thresher sharks**



Boero F. & A. Carli 1979 – Boll. Mus. Ist. Biol. Univ. Genoa (47)

#### Decline in Large Sharks's Catches by an Italian Tuna Trap

Baratti's "Tonnarella" Mackerel sharks 1898-05 1906-13 1914-22 **Basking shark** 1898-05 1906-13 1914-22 Thresher shark 1898-05 1906-13 1914-22 Hammerhead shark 1898-05 1906-13 1914-22 Sixgill shark 1898-05 1906-13 1914-22

4

2

3

Annual mean catches

0

1

Vacchi M. et al. 2000 - 4th-Meeting-of-the-European-Elasmobranch-Association-Proceedings

5

6

7

# Loss of Bluefin Tuna Populations in the Atlantic

North Sea Bluefin Tuna









## Strategy:

- Formulate the most important problem in terms of a critical model where in terms of a few parameters that can be well estimated.
- Compile all data in the world on the issue
- > Analyze it the right way









Outline of data flow to produce global maps of abundance for reef species. The goal is produce maps for species that are of interest to divers over time, and estimate the "pristine" abundances and biomass, and t he time trends over time to the present. This will be critical to estimating extinction probability.





Figure 3. Calibration of data gathered from professional and amateur divers.



Figure 3. Calibration of data gathered from professional and amateur divers.











### Mike James Andrea Ottensmeyer

## Identification of high-use areas and threats to leatherback sea turtles in northern waters

James, Ottensmeyer and Myers Ecology Letters (2005)



#### Weights in Canadian waters



Nesting female morphometrics: St. Croix, U.S.V.I. Boulon et al. 1996. Chelonian Conserv, Biol. 2:141-147. Lines fit by constant slope analysis of covariance after log transformation.

Turtles are 33% heavier in Canadian coastal areas versus on the nesting beach



Male leatherback movements

- not previously described
- annual migratory cycle that includes movement between temperate foraging areas and tropical breeding areas

James, Eckert and Myers Marine Biology (*in press*)



## Turtles are close to the surface during the day during migration



## Leatherback turtles are unique in that they expose their pineal spot to sunlight.



### Real Historical Data

HERATES.

W MALEN MALEN

Traffit and


















The efficiency of the Newfoundland cod fishery had not changed in 4 centuries.

The only bioeconomic equilibrium of a highly subsidized fishery is zero fish.

Catch rates in the 1980's \_\_\_\_ per person (20,000 fishers who caught ~200,000 metric tonnes of cod).



Year

Lewison et al. 2004 Ecology Letters







Swordfishing fleet at anchor, Neils Harbour, Cape Breton. -13.

#### Mike James Andrea Ottensmeyer

### Identification of high-use areas and threats to leatherback sea turtles in northern waters

James, Ottensmeyer and Myers Ecology Letters (2005)



#### Weights in Canadian waters



Nesting female morphometrics: St. Croix, U.S.V.I. Boulon et al. 1996. Chelonian Conserv, Biol. 2:141-147. Lines fit by constant slope analysis of covariance after log transformation.

Turtles are 33% heavier in Canadian coastal areas versus on the nesting beach



Male leatherback movements

- not previously described
- annual migratory cycle that includes movement between temperate foraging areas and tropical breeding areas

James, Eckert and Myers Marine Biology (*in press*)



# Leatherback turtles are unique in that they expose their pineal spot to sunlight.



# Turtles are close to the surface during the day during migration



### Turtles make more progress south during the day



Speed southward, degrees/day

### Totally Stupid Reasons for not Believing the Obvious

- > You ignore research surveys.
- Removing Large Predators Couldn't Possibly Affect Survival of Other Fish.
- Fishing Couldn't Possibly Affect the Size of Tuna.
- Fishermen are so stupid they cannot use satellite data to find tuna.
- Fishermen are so stupid that they don't improve their gear.

These estimates are conservative: 6 Fishermen are smarter (gps, satellite information, **ACDP** (Acoustic Current Doppler Profiler)).



Locations of a leatherback turtle over a two week period tagged by my student Mike James that maintains its position within a cold core ring (somehow).

However, fish may be a lot smarter too (the stupid ones were caught).

New Materials for	Species	Gangion	n
Fishing Gear	Swordfish	М	260
Double Efficiency		В	128
DOUDIE LIIICIEIICy Doculta from paired experiment	Yellowfin tuna	М	9
M – Monofilament		В	1
B – Multifilament (old gear)	Mako shark	М	58
		В	39
Design, every other gangion was monofilament	Blue shark	М	225
		В	116
A B	White marlin	М	47
		В	13
	Dolphinfish	М	27
	1	В	10
	Stingrav	М	63
		В	31
	Loggerhead turtle	М	40
81		В	26
tee C	Total	M	729

В

364

Figure 3 Monofilament nylon (A) and tarred multifilament nylon (B) gangions used for ten pelagic longline sets conducted off Georges Bank from 22 July to 2 August 1999.





(a) Day Operations



# Ecosystem changes are consistent with a 10 fold decline in predation

>Key prey species would be predicted to increase by the changes in predation rate

Table 7. The occurrence of bramidae and gempylidae in tuna and billfish stomach contents in other studies.

species	Bramidae	Gempylidae	Literature	Region
Bigeye tuna	High	low	Moteki et al. (2001)	Pacific
	High	no	Mattews et al. (1977)	Atlantic
Yellowfin tuna	High	low	Moteki et al. (2001)	Pacific
	High	low	Mattews et al. (1977)	Atlantic
Albacore	High	High	Mattews et al. (1977)	Atlantic
Sword fish	High	low	Moteki et al. (2001)	Pacific

PRELIMINARY STOMACH CONTENTS ANALYSIS OF PELAGIC FISH COLLECTED BY SHOYO-MARU 2002 RESEARCH CRUISE IN THE ATLANTIC OCEAN

Keisuke Satoh<sup>1</sup>, Kotaro Yokawa<sup>1</sup>, Hirokazu Saito<sup>1</sup>, Hiromasa Matsunaga<sup>1</sup>, Hiroaki Okamoto<sup>1</sup> and Yuji Uozumi<sup>1</sup> Col. Vol. Sci. Pap. ICCAT, 56(3): 1096-1114 (2004)





### Hammerhead eating stingray



Strong, W.R. Jr; Snelson, F.F. Jr; Gruber, S.H. Copeia 1990, 836-839

### Loss of hammerheads from surveys





















Trophic Cascades: Consequences of the loss of top predators may be greater than we think